



सत्यमेव जयते

न्यायालय मुख्यायुक्त दवियांगजन

COURT OF CHIEF COMMISSIONER FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES (DIVYANGJAN)

दवियांगजन सशक्तकरण वभिाग (दवियांगजन) / Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities (Divyangjan)

सामाजकि न्याय और अधकिारति मंत्रालय / Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment

भारत सरकार / Government of India

Case No. CCPD/15015/1101/24

Dated: 31/05/2024

Case No. 15015/1101/2024

In the matter of —

Prof. Avichal Bhatnagar,
R-123, Railway Enclave,
Pratap Vihar, Sector - 12,
Ghaziabad - 201009 (UP)
Email: coolavichal@gmail.com
Contact: 9899025113

... Complainant

Versus

The Director/Chief Executive Officer,
Pralek Prakashan Pvt. Ltd.,
J/50, Flat No.702, Global City,
Virar (West),
Thane – 401303 (Maharashtra)
Email: pralekprakashan@gmail.com
Contact No.: 7021263557

... Respondent

Hearing (I):



सत्यमेव जयते

न्यायालय मुख्यायुक्त दवियांगजन

COURT OF CHIEF COMMISSIONER FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES (DIVYANGJAN)

दवियांगजन सशक्तकरण वभाग (दवियांगजन) / Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities (Divyangjan)

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय / Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment

भारत सरकार / Government of India

Case No. CCPD/15015/1101/24

Dated: 31/05/2024

A hearing was conducted on **30.05.2024** on hybrid mode (online/offline). The following parties/representatives were present during the hearing:

S. No.	Name of the parties/ Representatives	Mode of appearing
For Complainant:		
1.	Prof. Avichal Bhatnagar, Complainant	Online
2.	Shri Rahul Bajaj, Advocate for the Complainant	Online
For Respondent:		
1.	Shri Jitendra Patro, Director Pralek Prakashan Pvt. Ltd.	Online
2.	Ms. Meena Mahajan, Advocate for the Respondent	Online

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

During the hearing, the Advocate for the Complainant submitted that the Respondent is not providing the soft copy of the book called 'Abode of Agony' published by the Respondent to the Complainant who is a 100% Visual Impairment and working as an Assistant Professor at Sri Guru Nanak Dev Khalsa College, University of Delhi and a doctoral student at Delhi Technological University. The book is written by *Dilip Kaul* and is a translated version of the book 'Dardpur' authored by *Shama Kaul* which is needed by the Complainant for his research work and thesis writing. The Complainant has taken an extension for submitting his thesis and, hence, he had very limited time to go through the book and use its content for formulating his research work. The learned counsel also requested for treating this not as an



सत्यमेव जयते

न्यायालय मुख्यायुक्त दवियांगजन

COURT OF CHIEF COMMISSIONER FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES (DIVYANGJAN)

दवियांगजन सशक्तकरण वभाग (दवियांगजन) / Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities (Divyangjan)

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय / Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment

भारत सरकार / Government of India

Case No. CCPD/15015/1101/24

Dated: 31/05/2024

individual case but as a general case affecting several persons with visual impairment and issuing directions to the authorities to create an infrastructure for easy availability of accessible books.

2. The Representative of the Respondent submitted that the Company/Publisher, against whom the Complainant has filed this Complaint, had never published the book and the Respondent Company has been struck off in the year 2022. Therefore, this is a case of misjoinder, and as such the matter is liable to be dismissed on this ground alone. However, the Respondent further submitted that the soft copy of the book is already available on 'Kindle' which can be availed by anyone.

3. This Court noted with due concern that the Respondent did not file any reply in the matter despite the notice dated 03rd January 2024 and reminder dated 09th February 2024. The Court also noted the need for books that are accessible to academics as well as to ordinary book lovers. However, the Court was not inclined to issue any direction to the Respondent to provide a soft copy to the Complainant as there are commercial interests involved in the matter. The Court was satisfied that in the instant case, the book was made available in accessible form. The Court directed the Respondent to share the link with the Complainant and with this Court within 3 days. In so far as the wider issue of creating an infrastructure for accessible books and other publications raised by the learned advocate, the Court appreciated the need for it and assured the Complainant to address the issue in its final order disposing of this case.

4. This is issued with the approval of the Chief Commissioner for Persons with Disabilities.



सत्यमेव जयते

न्यायालय मुख्यायुक्त दवियांगजन

COURT OF CHIEF COMMISSIONER FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES (DIVYANGJAN)

दवियांगजन सशक्तकरण वभाग (दवियांगजन) / Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities (Divyangjan)

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय / Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment

भारत सरकार / Government of India

Case No. CCPD/15015/1101/24

Dated: 31/05/2024

Yours faithfully,

(Praveen Prakash Ambashta)
Dy. Chief Commissioner